1

3

4

5

8

9

10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22 23

24

25 26

On October 3, 2008, relators filed a joint statement re discovery disagreement (Doc. Nos. 177 and 179). By this statement, relators seek an order compelling defendant to produce certain documents that post-date March 4, 2005. <sup>2</sup>

At the further hearing scheduled for October 9, 2008, Peter E. Leckman appeared for the relators. Jay D. Majors was present for non-intervening plaintiff United States of America. Wayne W. Smith and Kristopher P. Diulio appeared for defendant. The court gave careful consideration to the written materials submitted by the parties and to the arguments of counsel at both hearings. For the reasons set forth on the record, defendant's motion to compel further production of documents was denied, and relators' request for an order compelling production of documents that post-date March 4, 2005 was also denied.

As set forth more fully on the record, IT IS ORDERED that:

- 1. Defendant's July 16, 2008 motion (Doc. No. 167) to compel relators' further production of documents is denied as is defendant's request for in camera review of documents;
- 2. Relators' October 3, 2008 request (Doc. No. 179) for order compelling defendant to produce documents that post-date March 4, 2005 is denied without prejudice; and
- 3. Defendant's production of documents pursuant to this court's April 11, 2008 order in open court (order filed April 15, 2008), shall be completed by January 16, 2009, absent further order of the court.

DATED: October 9, 2008.

Ddad1/orders.civil/hendow0457.oah.100908

UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

Although the caption of the joint statement indicates a hearing date of October 9, 2008, the statement was not accompanied by a notice of motion and motion. See Local Rule 37-251(a) (providing that a discovery dispute may be placed on the magistrate judge's next regularly scheduled calendar at least three court days after the filing of a notice of motion and motion concurrently with a joint statement).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Relators' previous motion to compel (Doc. No. 154) was heard on April 11, 2008, and was resolved by order filed April 15, 2008 (Doc. No. 165).